## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION



WASHINGTON, D.C. 20580

## September 22, 2008

Edmund G. Brown, Jr.
Attorney General of California
California Department of Justice
1300 I Street, Suite 1740
Sacramento, CA 95814

Richard Blumenthal Attorney General of Connecticut Office of the Attorney General 55 Elm Street Hartford, CT 06141-0120

Lawrence Wasden Attorney General of Idaho Office of the Attorney General 700 W. State Street, 2nd Floor Boise, ID 83720

Lisa Madigan Attorney General of Illinois Office of the Attorney General James R. Thompson Center 100 West Randolph Street Chicago, IL 60601

Tom Miller Attorney General of Iowa Office of the Attorney General Hoover State Office Building 1305 East Walnut Des Moines, IA 50319

Stephen Six Attorney General of Kansas Office of the Attorney General 120 S.W. 10 Avenue, 2 Floor Topeka, KS 66612-1597 Steven Rowe Attorney General of Maine Office of the Attorney General State House Station Six Augusta, ME 04333

Martha Coakley Attorney General of Massachusetts Office of the Attorney General One Ashburton Place Boston, MA 02108-1698

Jim Hood Attorney General of Mississippi Department of Justice Post Office Box 220 Jackson, MS 39205-0220

W.A. Drew Edmondson Attorney General of Oklahoma Office of the Attorney General State Capitol, Room 112 2300 North Lincoln Boulevard Oklahoma City, OK 73105

Hardy Myers Attorney General of Oregon Office of the Attorney General Justice Building 1162 Court Street NE Salem, OR 97301

Patrick Lynch Attorney General of Rhode Island Office of the Attorney General 150 South Main Street Providence, RI 02903 Rob McKenna Attorney General of Washington Office of the Attorney General 900 4th Street, Suite 2000 Olympia, WA 98504-0100 Darrell V. McGraw, Jr. Attorney General of West Virginia Office of the Attorney General State Capitol 1900 Kanawha Boulevard East Charleston, WV 25305

In the Matter of Negotiated Data Solutions LLC File No. 051-0094

Dear Honorable Attorneys General:

Re:

Thank you for your comments as the Attorneys General of California, Connecticut, Idaho, Illinois, Iowa, Kansas, Maine, Massachusetts, Mississippi, Oklahoma, Oregon, Rhode Island, Washington and West Virginia ("the States") regarding the proposed consent order accepted for public comment in the above-captioned matter. The States note that they have a direct interest in the integrity of standard setting. State agencies are among the purchasers of products that benefit from the efficiencies of standardization. Moreover, government agencies often incorporate standards into codes and regulations, relying on the expertise of standard setting organizations and avoiding the costs of duplicative research and testing. The Commission has reviewed the comments of the States, and has placed them on the public record of the proceeding.

The States' comment letter expresses support for the Commission's decision in this matter and favors final adoption of the proposed order. The States note that standard setting activities have the potential for significant consumer benefit as well as for anticompetitive harm. The States discuss the concept of patent ambush, in which a company that refuses to comply with standard setting organization requirements as to patent disclosure and the provision of licensing assurances, later engages in opportunism once the industry is locked into a standard incorporating its technology. The States explain that conduct in the standard-setting arena that falls short of being deceptive can still be anticompetitive. The States conclude that reneging by N-Data on its promised terms was coercive and not justified by efficiencies. The States' comment concludes that the Commission's proposed remedy in this matter is reasonable.

Thank you for your interest in this matter. After considering all the comments, including the comment of the States, the Commission has determined that the public interest would be served best by issuing the Decision and Order in final form without modification.

By direction of the Commission, Chairman Kovacic dissenting.

Donald S. Clark Secretary