UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

In the Matter of)	
in the watter of)	
Tapestry, Inc.,)	DOCKET NO. 9429
a corporation,)	
and)))	
Capri Holdings Limited,)	
a corporation,)	
Respondents.)	
_)	

THIRD PARTY AEFFE GROUP INC.'S MOTION FOR IN CAMERA TREATMENT

Pursuant to Rule 3.45 of the Federal Trade Commission's Rules of Practice, 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(b), third party Aeffe Group Inc. ("Aeffe") respectfully moves this Court for *in camera* treatment of a highly competitively-sensitive, confidential business documents, bearing Exhibit No. DX-0240 – AEFFE-FTC-000001 (the "Confidential Document"). Aeffe produced this document, among others, in connection with *Federal Trade Commission v. Tapestry, Inc.*, No. 1:24-cv-03109-JLR (S.D.N.Y.) in response to a subpoena issued by Tapestry, Inc. in that action. Counsel for Respondent Tapestry, Inc., has now notified Aeffe that it intends to introduce this Confidential Document into evidence at the administrative trial in this Rule 3 proceeding. *See* email correspondence dated August 30, 2024 (attached as **Exhibit A**).

For the reasons discussed in this motion, Aeffe requests that this Court afford the Confidential Document *in camera* treatment indefinitely. In support of this motion, Aeffe relies on the Declaration of Khoa Nguyen (the "Nguyen Declaration"), attached as **Exhibit B**, which provides additional details on the Confidential Document.

I. THE CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENTS

Aeffe seeks *in camera* treatment for the Confidential Document, a copy of which is attached hereto as **Exhibit C**. Aeffe is a third party to this action and, but for the subpoena it received in the *Federal Trade Commission v. Tapestry, Inc.*, No. 1:24-cv-03109-JLR (S.D.N.Y.), the Confidential Document would not have been made available to anyone outside of Aeffe.

II. LEGAL STANDARD

Entities involved in Rule 3 proceedings may move the Court to "obtain *in camera* treatment for material, or portions thereof, offered into evidence." 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(b). *In camera* treatment of material is appropriate when its "public disclosure will likely result in a clearly defined, serious injury to the person, partnership, or corporation requesting" such treatment. *Id.* "[M]aterial made subject to an *in camera* order will be kept confidential and not placed on the public record of the proceeding in which it was submitted." 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(a). "Only respondents, their counsel, authorized Commission personnel, and court personnel concerned with judicial review may have access thereto, provided that the Administrative Law Judge, the Commission and reviewing courts may disclose such *in camera* material to the extent necessary for the proper disposition of the proceeding." *Id.*

III. ARGUMENT

An entity seeking *in camera* treatment of a document must "make a clear showing that the information concerned is sufficiently secret and sufficiently material to [its] business that disclosure would result in serious competitive injury." *In the Matter of Otto Bock HealthCare N. Am., Inc.*, 2018 WL 2491602, at *1 (F.T.C. July 2, 2018) (internal quotation omitted). The submission of a declaration in support of the secret nature of such a document, such as that which as attached as Exhibit B to this motion, is essential. *In the Matter of Benco Dental Supply Co., A*

Corp., Henry Schein, Inc., A Corp., & Patterson Companies, Inc., A Corp. Respondents., No. 9379, 2018 WL 5292624, at *2 (F.T.C. Oct. 11, 2018).

The Confidential Document contains information related to Aeffe's business and marking plans. Information "such as...pricing to customers, business costs and profits, as well as business plans, marketing plans, or sales documents" has been granted *in camera* treatment during Rule 3 proceedings. *In the Matter of 1-800 Contacts, Inc., A Corp.*, No. 9372, 2017 WL 1493851, at *8 (F.T.C. Apr. 7, 2017); *see also In the Matter of Mcwane, Inc., A Corp., and Star Pipe Products, Ltd., A LP, Respondents.*, 9351, 2012 WL 3862131, at *10 (F.T.C. Aug. 17, 2012) (protecting "purchase and sales data"). "Five years of *in camera* treatment is routinely granted for competitively sensitive business records, including documents revealing competitive positioning, strategic plans, and marketing strategies." *In the Matter of Meta Platforms, Inc., A Corporation, Mark Zuckerberg, A Natural Person, and Within Unlimited, Inc., A Corporation*, 2022 WL 18273876, at *2 (collecting cases).

The Confidential Document was created in 2024 and is a presentation containing, among other things, information regarding Aeffe's strategic growth plans and priorities, analysis of competitors and evaluations, marketing strategies and product development strategies. *See* Nguyen Declaration, ¶ 6. Moreover, requests for *in camera* treatment of documents by third parties deserve "special solitude." *In the Matter of Kaiser Aluminum & Chem. Corp.*, 103 F.T.C. 500 (F.T.C. 1984). "As a policy matter, extensions of confidential or *in camera* treatment in appropriate cases involving third party bystanders encourages cooperation with future adjudicative discovery requests." *Id.*

As such, the content of the Confidential Document clearly falls within the scope of information designed to be protected by 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(b), and warrants it being granted *in*

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION | OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY | FILED 09/10/2024 OSCAR NO 611638 | PAGE Page POLIBLIC

camera treatment to prevent Respondent Tapestry, Inc., as well as other competitors, from having

access to some of Aeffe's most competitively sensitive information.

IV. CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth above, and in the Nguyen Declaration, Aeffe respectfully requests

permanent in camera treatment of the Confidential Document to protect in from public disclosure.

Dated: September 10, 2024

By: /s/ Jonathan E. Temchin

Jonathan E. Temchin

TARTER KRINSKY & DROGIN LLP

1350 Broadway

New York, NY 10018

Email: jtemchin@tarterkrinsky.com

Tel: (212) 216-8000 Fax: (212) 216-8001

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on September 10, 2024, I filed the forgoing documents electronically using the FTC's E-Filing System, which will send notification of such to the following:

The Honorable Dania L. Ayoubi
Office of the Administrative Law Judges
Federal Trade Commission
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Room H-110
Washington, DC 20580
(oalj@ftc.gov)

April Tabor Secretary Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Rm. H-110 Washington, DC 20580 (<u>ElectronicFilings@ftc.gov</u>)

I also certify that I caused the foregoing document to be served via email to:

Kassandra DiPietro	Christopher S. Yates	Jonathan M. Moses
(kdipietro@ftc.gov)	(chris.yates@lw.com)	(<u>JMMoses@wlrk.com</u>)
	David L. Johnson	Elaine P. Golin
Complaint Counsel	(david.johnson@lw.com)	(EPGolin@wlrk.com)
	Christopher J. Brown	Damian G. Didden
	(chris.brown@lw.com)	(DGDidden@wlrk.com)
	Counsel for Respondent	Counsel for Respondent
	Tapestry, Inc	Capri Holdings Limited

Dated: September 10, 2024

/s/ Jonathan E. Temchin
Jonathan E. Temchin, Esq.

Attorneys for Non-Party Aeffe Group Inc.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

	_
In the Matter of))
Tapestry, Inc., a corporation,) DOCKET NO. 9429
and Capri Holdings Limited,))
a corporation,))
Respondents.))
[PROP	OSED] ORDER
Upon consideration of Aeffe Group	Inc.'s Motion for <i>In Camera</i> Treatment 16 C.F.R.
§3.45, it is HEREBY ORDERED that Exhib	oit No. DX-0240 – AEFFE-FTC-000001 be afforded
in camera treatment in its entirety.	
The Motion is hereby GRANTED.	
ORDERED:	
	The Honorable Dania L. Ayoubi Administrative Law Judge
Date:	

EXHIBIT A



From: Karen.Kim@lw.com>

Sent: Friday, August 30, 2024 5:04 PM

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION | OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY | FILED 09/10/2024 OSCAR NO 611638 | PAGE Page POLIBLIC

To: Jonathan E. Temchin < <u>itemchin@tarterkrinsky.com</u>> **Cc:** <u>David.Johnson@lw.com</u>; <u>Sarah.Stebbins@lw.com</u>

Subject: [EXT] FTC v. Tapestry, Inc. - Part 3 Exhibit List Notice - Aeffe Group

Counsel,

Pursuant to the Scheduling Order and Protective Order *In the Matter of Tapestry Inc., and Capri Holdings Ltd.*, Dkt No. 9439 (attached for reference) and 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(b), we are providing notice that we intend to offer materials or testimony provided by Aeffe Group (the "third party") as evidence at the FTC's Part 3 administrative evidentiary hearing beginning on September 25, 2024 in Washington, DC. Accordingly, pursuant to the Scheduling Order in this matter, if a third party wishes *in camera* treatment for a document or transcript that a party intends to introduce into evidence, that third party shall file an appropriate motion with the Administrative Law Judge within ten (10) days after it receives notice of a party's intent to introduce such material. Respondents will not oppose any proposed *in camera* treatment. The materials and/or testimony included are:

DX-0240 - AEFFE-FTC-000001

Best, Karen

Karen Keun-Yong Kim Pronouns: She/Her/Hers

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

1271 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10020 Direct Dial: +1.332.240.1416 Email: <u>karen.kim@lw.com</u> https://www.lw.com

This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any review, disclosure, reliance or distribution by others or forwarding without express permission is strictly prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies including any attachments.

Latham & Watkins LLP or any of its affiliates may monitor electronic communications sent or received by our networks in order to protect our business and verify compliance with our policies and relevant legal requirements. Any personal information contained or referred to within this electronic communication will be processed in accordance with the firm's privacy notices and Global Privacy Standards available at www.lw.com.

Tarter Krinsky & Drogin is fully operational in-person. However, because of anticipated delays in receiving regular mail and other deliveries, please e-mail copies of anything you send by regular mail or delivery, including issuing remittances electronically. Please contact our receptionist at reception@tarterkrinsky.com or by phone at 212-216-8000 with any questions. Thank you in advance for your courtesies.

NOTE: If regular mailing or other specific transmission type is required by terms of a contract, order or statute, please comply with those obligations and transmit the materials by the means set forth in the agreement, order or statute as well as by email.

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION | OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY | FILED 09/10/2024 OSCAR NO 611638 | PAGE Page 10 of BLICBLIC Confidentiality Disclosure: This information in this email and in attachments is confidential and intended solely for the attention and use of the named (addressee(s). This information may be subject to attorney/client privilege or may otherwise be protected by work product privilege or other legal rules. It must not be disclosed to any person without our authority. If you are not the intended recipient, or a person responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are not authorized to disclose, and must not disclose, copy, distribute, or retain this message or any part of it.

This email is an informal communication that is not meant to be legally binding upon the sender unless expressly noted to the contrary.

Tarter Krinsky & Drogin LLP, Attorneys-at-Law.

EXHIBIT B

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of)	
Tapestry, Inc.,)) DOCKET NO. 94	29
a corporation,)	
Capri Holdings Limited,))	
a corporation,)	
Respondents.))	

<u>AEFFE GROUP INC.'S MOTION FOR IN CAMERA TREATMENT</u>

I, Khoa Nguyen, hereby declare as follows:

- 1. I am the President of Aeffe Group Inc. ("Aeffe"). I make this declaration in support of Non-Party Aeffe Group Inc.'s Motion for *In Camera* Treatment (the "Motion"). I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this declaration, and if called as a witness, I could testify competently under oath to such facts.
- 2. I have reviewed the document referenced in this Declaration, as well the documents produced by Aeffe in *Federal Trade Commission v. Tapestry, Inc.*, No. 1:24-cv-03109-JLR (S.D.N.Y.) in response to a subpoena issued by Tapestry, Inc. in that action. These documents were produced as confidential under a protective order issued in that action. Aeffe received notice by Respondent's counsel that document bearing production number DX-0240 AEFFE-FTC-000001 (the "Confidential Document") may be used in connection with the parties' evidentiary hearings before the federal court and before the FTC.

- 3. Aeffe moved the federal court for a sealing order to preserve the confidential nature of the Confidential Document, which such motion was granted on September 6, 2024. Aeffe now moves the FTC for a similar order to grant *in camera* treatment of the Confidential Document.
- 4. As President of Aeffe, I am familiar with not only the content of the Confidential Document, but also the highly sensitive nature of the information contained within it and it competitive significance to Aeffe. My review of the Confidential Document, as well as my familiarity with Aeffe's business and the confidentiality protection afforded to the type of information provided by Aeffe, serve as the basis for my submission that the public disclosure of the Confidential Document would cause serious competitive injury to Aeffe.
- 5. Aeffe is a company involved in the fashion and luxury industry and is active in the creation, production and distribution of a wide range of products including prêt-à-porter, footwear and leather goods, lingerie and beachwear. Aeffe has a focus on uniqueness and exclusivity, and serves as a home to several proprietary brands, including "Alberta Ferretti," "Philosophy di Lorenzo Serafini," "Moschino," and "Pollini."
- 6. The Confidential Document contains highly confidential and commercially sensitive information. It is a powerpoint presentation containing, among other things, information regarding Aeffe's strategic growth plans and priorities, analysis of competitors and evaluations, marketing strategies and product development strategies. Aeffe depends on the confidentiality of its strategic growth plans and marketing strategies to remain competitive within an already highly competitive industry. The disclosure of this confidential information would allow Aeffe's competitors to review and replicate aspects of Aeffe's business model, and benefit from its proprietary market research and related evaluations. The Confidential Document represents work

product that is unique to Aeffe based on the expenditure of its internal resources to develop a plan for its own competitive advantage.

7. In light of the above, the protection from public disclosure of this information is necessary to eliminate the substantial prejudice that would be suffered by Aeffe should it be released, along with the irreparable competitive and financial harm that would follow as a result.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on September 9, 2024. Khoa Nguyen

EXHIBIT E"

DX-0240 - AEFFE-FTC-000001"

Eqphf gpvkcn/'Tgf cevgf '
kp'Gpvkt gv{ '''

11